Total Quality Management Principles as Correlates of Effective Performance in Small and Medium Scale Enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria

Chimezie Comfort Okolocha

Department of Technology and Vocational Education, Nnamdi Azikiwe University, Awka

Ifeanyi kalu Mong

Department of Vocational and Technical Education, Alex Ekwueme Federal University, Ndufu-Alike, Ebonyi State **Email:** ifeanyikalu664@gmail.com DOI 10.56201/ijebm.v10.no7.2024.pg171.184

Abstract

The study examined total quality management principles as correlates of effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises (SMEs) in Abia State, Nigeria. Two research questions guided the study while two research hypotheses were tested. The study adopted correlational design. The population of the study comprised 1,809 entrepreneurs of small and medium-scale enterprises registered with Abia State Ministry of Trade and Investment. Simple random sampling technique was used to sample 328 SME managers for the study. Structured questionnaire was used for data collection. Three experts were used to validate the instrument for data collection. Reliability of the instrument was established using Cronbach's alpha and it yielded alpha values of 0.89, 0.90, and 0.89 for the three clusters, respectively. Data analysis was done using Pearson correlation coefficient and multiple regression analysis. Findings from the study revealed that there was a significant positive correlation between customer focus and effective performance in SME while there was no significant positive correlation between employee education and effective performance in SME. Based on the findings, it was recommended that business educators should adopt learner- centered pedagogies to engage the students more in problem-solving activities involving customer focus and all customer service activities.

Keywords: Total quality management, effective performance, small and medium scale enterprises, customer focus, employee education

1. Introduction

Small and medium scale enterprises (SMEs) are common and very useful in every economy. They constitute the largest group of businesses in terms of numbers in any economy. Small and medium scale enterprises operating in the country play very crucial roles towards the development of the society. These roles according to Obi (2015) include raising standard of living of the people and developing the economy. Dikeocha, Nwaiwu, Nwagu, and Amaechi, (2018) opined that SMEs give individuals opportunity to become their own boss through self-employment and thus improve their living standard. The authors further asserted that SMEs have contributed a lot in mobilizing and utilizing domestic and dormant resources. Small and medium scale enterprises are potential economic energizers that help to keep the economy afloat. They promote self-reliance, provide a pool of potential entrepreneurs and serve as training grounds for budding entrepreneurs and potentials managers of large enterprises.

Other importance of small and medium scale enterprises abound and are inexhaustible. Musavi and Maingi (2017) asserted that SMEs have been the means through which rapid industrialization and economic growth have been realized in most nations like India and Japan. Economy of many developed nations is driven by SMEs. Scholars such as Aziz, Mahmood, Tajudin and Abdullah (2014), Aribaba, Ahmodu, Olaleye and Yusuff (2019) maintained that attaining economic development is an important goal of every developing nation and that SMEs play important role in achieving such goal by boosting productivity, creating jobs and reducing income inequality. This according to Anifowose, Ghasemi and Olaleye, (2022) implies that SMEs help to accelerate economic growth and development through employment generation, increase in Gross Domestic Products (GDP) and creation of better standard of living.

Although SMEs play crucial roles towards economic development, their performances are seen to be falling below expectation. Ademola, Olaleye, Olusuyi and Edun (2018) reported that in developing countries like Nigeria, 78% of businesses fail within the first twelve months, only 22% make it to ten years. A related report by Carter (2020) has it that about 20% of SMEs fail within their first year of existence, 30% fail within two years, 50% fail within five years and by the end of a decade only 30% will remain. These negative reports attest to the fact that SMEs in Nigeria are far from achieving optimum performance as expected of them. According to Uzoho (2023), Nigeria has maintained the infamous position as the poverty capital of the world, with 93.9 million people living below poverty line and surviving below \$1.9 per day. Nigeria, with a population of over 200 million people, was first declared the world's poverty capital in 2018 in a report by the Brookings Institution, knocking off India from the position. The report further asserted that extreme poverty in Nigeria is growing by six people every minute, while poverty in India continues to fall. This rapid growth in extreme poverty is prevalent in Abia State, being one of the 36 States in Nigeria.

In Abia State, the economic situation of the people and businesses are not better than many other States. According to Ugwu (2023), the rate of unemployment in the State increased from 28.6% in the year 2015, to 50.07% in the year 2020 due to a steady decline in the performance of SMEs in the State. This, according to the author has made 33.9% of the people of Abia State to be multidimensionally poor, being the worst in the South-East of Nigeria. Also, Okeowo and Fatoba (2022) revealed that 78.51% of Abia's total recurrent revenue came from federal allocation account. This implies that the internally generated revenue of the State is low despite the fact that

the State has the largest leather and shoe-making market in the nation and many other SMEs as a commercial State. The authors further stated that analysis of revenue from the state of States report shows that Abia State's per capita internally-generated revenue (IGR) was №3, 957: less than the average IGR per capita of №6, 131 for the entire federation. The state of States report further revealed that Abia is the 18th most indebted state in the nation with a total debt stock of №136bn. Abia's total debt stock increased by 8.78% from №125.92bn in 2020 to №136.98bn in 2021. This adverse economic situation in the State is perhaps the reason for the declining standard of living of Abia citizens.

Efforts by the state government in exposing SME operators to greater opportunities have not yielded the desired result as most of these enterprises based on the researcher's observations, are still performing below expectation. Gisaor, Iyortsuun and Musa (2019) stated that many of the SMEs in Abia State are on the verge of collapsing while others have collapsed already. Some of these SMEs according to Abubakar and Hussaina, (2020), collapse within the first five years of their establishment. Besides, SMEs in Aba and other parts of Abia State struggle for their goods and services to be accepted in international markets due to poor quality and packaging (Igbadio and Asamber, 2021). Many of the SMEs struggle to produce, manage and improve their businesses efficiently in order to consistently deliver quality products that meet customer demands and compete favourably with their internal and external competitors. Decrying the poor quality state of Aba leather industry, Odinaka (2022) maintained that Aba leather industry is still thriving in chaos with its production amounting to 0.13 per cent of the global output and that the industry has not produced sufficient foreign exchange to support the country in the present period of dollar crunch. The author further reported that one of the biggest challenges facing Aba leather industry is poor quality of output, which has made many Nigerians to often complain about the lack of durability of locally-made shoes or bags and thus resulting in low patronage of the products.

Based on literature reviewed, some researchers and business executives have attributed the poor performance of SMEs to inability to access credit facility, unavailability and high cost of inputs. In consonance, Anifowose, Ghasemi and Olaleye, (2022) attributed it to unfavourable domestic and international trade restriction, lack of infrastructures, inflation, stiff competition and policy comatose in Abia State. Besides these attributed factors that lead to poor performance of SMEs, some operators of SMEs seem to be naive about the influence of total quality management (TQM) principles on the performance of SMEs, hence seem not to apply TQM principles in running their businesses. Thus, it becomes imperative to determine whether the application of TQM principles would positively and significantly improve the performance of SMEs; in order to enlighten SME managers and encourage them to apply same in the management of their businesses.

1.2 Purpose of the Study

The purpose of this study was to examine total quality management principles as correlates of effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria. Specifically, the study examined:

1. Employee education as a correlate of effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria

2. Customer focus as a correlate of effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria

1.3 Research Questions

The following research questions guided the study.

- 1. What is the correlation between employee education and effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria?
- 2. What is the correlation between customer focus and effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria?

1.4 Research Hypotheses

The under-listed research hypotheses were tested:

- 1. Employee education would significantly predict effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria
- 2. Customer focus would significantly predict effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria

1.5 Literature Review

1.5.1 Total Quality Management Principles

Total quality management (TQM) is a business management practice that prioritises customer satisfaction and the organization's overall performance by ensuring that customers' expectations are adequately met. Total quality management, according to Snongtaweeporn, Siribensanont, Kongsong and Channuwong (2020), was developed by W. Edwards Deming in the 1940s and implemented in his efforts to assist the Japanese in rebuilding their manufacturing infrastructure following the World War II. Ali and Johl (2021) added that TQM was developed from the integration of management theories and quality concepts, which were influenced by Deming's 14-points and Juran's quality trilogy. The concept of TQM was developed as a solution to the prevalent poor quality of products in the US then, which resulted to economic downturn and loss of customers to foreign competitors who were offering better quality products. Total quality management according to Anifowose, Ghasemi and Olaleye (2022) is a business management philosophy for the whole organization to maximize customer satisfaction, gain better product quality and to obtain higher productivity through the systematic removal of waste and the reduction of non-productive activities. This therefore corroborates Ali and Johl (2021) who had earlier averred that TQM is an emerging system of practices, tools, and training to manage businesses in a constantly changing environment to ensure customer satisfaction. Total quality management practically guarantees that employee tries to enhance work culture, procedures, services and systems for long-term success to be achieved. Overall, it is a management concept that aims to incorporate all organizational tasks to objectively improve quality of products and services in order to meet consumers' needs. Its goal is to improve quality and sustain profitability in business. Douglas and Judge (2017) considered the application of TQM principles by SME managers as a critical determinant of the success and survival of a firm as well as a source of competitive advantage of both manufacturing and service organizations.

Adherence to TQM principles could be efficacious in entrenching efficiency and effectiveness of business operations. In the current global challenging business environment, the implementation of TQM principles can significantly help fulfill the needs of customers by providing them with quality products and services. Total quality management helps to boost corporate performance by distinguishing their goods and obtaining a competitive market position (Herzallah, Gutiérrez-Gutiérrez & Munoz, 2014). Total quality management can serve as a tool that helps businesses to cope with the dynamism of the global market and its fast transformation. Anifowose, Ghasemi and Olaleye (2022) acknowledged total quality management as a globally advanced strategy for attaining quality goods and services that results in operational performance excellence. Hence, a forward-looking enterprise that aims to acquire both short-term and longterm benefits in a leading competitive market must apply TQM principles in all its operations. This is essential for future growth and optimum business performance. Total quality management principles are customer focus, employee education, process management, top management commitment, effective communication, benchmarking, supplier relationship management, employee involvement, strategic and systematic approach, teamwork, continuous improvement, research and development, integrated system and fact-based decision making. However, in this study, total quality management principles shall be restricted to employee education and customer focus.

1.5.2 Employee Education

Employee education refers to the process of assisting employees to acquire new knowledge, skills and attitude required for efficiency and effectiveness at work. It includes providing employees the opportunity for further training and re-training periodically. Employee education is a vital TQM principle. This is because regular training and re-training of employees helps them to acquire new knowledge and skills to improve on their work. Employee education is important for achieving growth, development and success of the firm. Prioritizing employee education enables the firm to foster a culture of continuous learning, innovation and excellence. Although capacity building programme for employees may seems to be expensive and adds to the production cost, managers of SMEs should not neglect it but to consider it as a necessary activity to achieve a long-term benefit. The long-term benefits that accrue from regular employee training outweigh its short-term cost. Small and medium scale enterprise managers should train their employees on how to make use of a range of technologies to improve their expertise and competency. Employees should be given opportunity for further educational training through inservice training, workshops, seminars, sandwich programme, mentorships, cross-functional training, online course trainings and on-the-job training. Small and medium scale enterprise managers should regularly conduct or allow their employees to participate in seminars, conferences and symposium within and outside the country in order to be abreast with contemporary methods of operation and processes. According to Olusanya and Adegbola (2014), for employees to be efficient and effective at work, they need transformational skills such as critical thinking, adaptability, creativity, innovation, problem-solving, good interpersonal skills

and social skills. Employee education plays an important role in giving the employees opportunity to acquire these useful skills.

Overall, the efficacy of employee education as a TQM principle, on the performance of SME seems to be contested among researchers. This is because some scholars believe that there is a significant positive correlation between TQM principles and effective business performance while others hold a contrary view. Accordingly, Zhou (2019) observed that only few researchers have addressed total quality management principles in SMEs' operational performance. Scholars such as Aper and Ushahemba (2021), Sahoo and Yadav, (2018), Al-Dhaafri, Al-Swidi and Yusoff, (2016); among others, claim that there exists a significant positive relationship between total quality management principles and effective SME performance while AlQershi, Mokhtar and Abas, (2020); Bamfo and Kraa (2019); Kober, Subraamanniam and Watson (2016) believe that TQM has a negative impact and a less-than-optimal outcome on effective performance of SMEs. As a result of these contradictory and inconsistent findings, it becomes necessary to further research on the correlation between TQM principles and effective performance of SMEs in order to corroborate or refute extant findings on this subject by previous researchers.

1.5.3 Customer Focus

Customer focus as a TQM principle means being proactive in responding to current and emerging customer needs, sustaining effective customer relationship and commanding customer loyalty. It entails prioritizing the needs, wants and expectations of customers and delivering products or services that meet or exceed their preferred standards. Putting customers at the core of business strategy builds loyalty, drives growth and makes the firm to stay ahead of competition. Hietschold, Reinhardt and Gurtner (2014) stated that concentrating efforts and resources on the principle of customer focus entails that SME managers increase and sustain their customer loyalty and satisfaction by producing and innovating new products that meet the requirements and expectations of consumers. Additionally, SMEs managers should ensure that customers get satisfaction that is commensurate with the value or amount of money they pay for such goods or services. According to Sader, Husti and Daroczi (2017), customer focus as one of the TQM principles underscores the importance of making customers feel happy and satisfied about their consumption of the firm's product. Such customer happiness and satisfaction could come from providing quality goods and services, providing customized product and services, offering good prices for products, offering convenient packaging and preferred product colours and sizes. Other activities of being customer focused include attending to customers' complaints and suggestions, timely delivery of goods in sufficient quantities and offering bonuses, provision of adequate information on the use of goods, offer of after-sale services to customers and providing discounts and credit facility where necessary. All these and more will help the business to endear itself with the customers and thus make the firm to become household name for customers. This in turn, improves the performance of the enterprise.

1.5.4 Effective performance in Small and Medium Scale Enterprises

Effective performance in SMEs is the degree to which SMEs are able to realise their short-term, medium-term and long-term business goals. According to Dzisi and Ofosu (2014), effective performance of SMEs takes a look at whether or not SMEs are able to attain set standards and

objectives desired by operators and employees. In the opinion of Lin and Lin (2016), the term effective performance, explores how efficient the strategies of SMEs are in actualizing organizational goals and objectives relating to production, distribution, sales, innovation, resource allocation, human resource management, among others. Contributing, Aper and Ushahemba (2021) highlighted some of the key indicators of effective business performance to include size of revenue, return on investment, equity, liquidity, financial assets and capital base. Igwe, Ogundana, Egere and Anigbo (2018) opined that as SMEs perform more effectively and efficiently in all the key performance indicators, the overall national economy is improved. Jobs are created, domestic demands are satisfied, standards of living rise, cost of living declines and foreign trade through exportation grows. Effective business performance could be enhanced through the application of total quality management (TQM) principles by SME managers. Hence, TQM principles are the thrust of this research.

1.6 Methods

Correlational research design was adopted in this study. According to Nworgu (2015), correlational design is a research design that seeks to establish what relationship that exists between two or more variables. Correlational survey design was considered appropriate for this study since it sought to establish relationship between total quality management principles and performance of small and medium scale enterprises without establishing causation of the relationship. This is in line with Wubante (2020) who stated that correlational survey research is used when the researcher seeks to measure, understand and to assess the statistical relationship between two variables with no influence from any extraneous variable and when it is not possible or desirable to experimentally manipulate the independent variable of interest. The study was carried out in Abia State, Nigeria. The population for this study comprised 1,809 managers of SMEs whose businesses are registered with Abia State Ministry of Commerce and Industry. The SME managers were chosen due to their active involvement in the daily management of the business and so the researcher believed that they were in a position to give useful information for the study. The sample size of the study was 328 managers of registered of small and medium-scale enterprises. Simple random sampling technique was used to sample members of the respondents. Structured questionnaire developed by the researcher was used as instrument for data collection. Validity of the instrument was established using three experts. Also, the reliability of the instrument was established using Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) software to determine the reliability index of each section of the instrument. Cronbach's alpha values of 0.89, 0.90 and 0.89 were obtained for the three clusters, respectively and were considered high enough to regard the instrument reliable for the study. The researcher adopted a direct approach in the administration of the instrument using five research assistants. Pearson product-moment correlation coefficient and multiple linear regression analysis were used as methods of data analysis. These methods of data analysis were considered appropriate since the study sought to establish relationship between total quality management principles and performance of SMEs.

1.7 Results

Results of data analysis are presented below:

Table 1: Pearson correlation between employee education, customer focus and effective SME performance

		Effective		Customer
		Performance	Education	Focus
Effective	Pearson	1	151**	.107
Performance	Correlation			
	Sig. (2-tailed)		.009	.066
	N	295	295	295
Employee	Pearson	151**	1	.171**
Education	Correlation			
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.009		.003
	N	295	295	295
Customer Focus	Pearson	.107	.171**	1
	Correlation			
	Sig. (2-tailed)	.066	.003	
	N	295	295	295

^{**.} Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level (2-tailed).

Table 2: Model Summary

			_			- J				
				Std. Error	Change Statistics					
		R	Adjusted	of the	R Square	F			Sig. F	
Model	R	Square	R Square	Estimate	Change	Change	df1	df2	Change	
1	.203ª	.041	.034	1.23695	.041	6.249	2	292	.002	

a. Predictors: (Constant), Customer Focus, Employee Education

Table 3: ANOVA^a

Mode	el	Sum of Squares	Df	Mean Square	F	Sig.
1	Regression	19.124	2	9.562	6.249	.002 ^b
	Residual	446.774	292	1.530		
	Total	465.898	294			

a. Dependent Variable: Effective performance in SMEs

Table 1 was used to analyse data for answering research questions 1 and 2. The Table shows the result of Pearson correlations between employee education, customer focus and effective SME performance. Results of data analysis in Table 1 show that employee education (r = -.15, P = .01) does not have a significant positive correlation with effective SME performance.

b. Predictors: (Constant), Customer Focus, Employee Education

This implies that the application of principle of employee education in managing SMEs will not lead to effective performance of the business.

Also, results of data in Table 1 shows that customer focus (r = 0.11, P = .07) has a significant positive correlation with effective SME performance. This implies that the application of the principle of customer focus in managing SMEs will lead to effective performance of SMEs.

Table 4:Test of Hypotheses

Coefficients"									
				Standardi					
				zed					
		Unstandardized		Coefficie			95.0% Co	onfidence	
		Coefficients		nts			Interval for B		
			Std.				Lower	Upper	Decision
Model		В	Error	Beta	T	Sig.	Bound	Bound	
1	(Constant)	4.008	.422		9.505	.000	3.178	4.838	
	Employee	193	.064	175	_	.003	320	066	Reject
	Education				3.000				
	Customer	.176	.075	.137	2.355	.019	.029	.324	Accept
	Focus								_

a. Dependent Variable: Performance of SMEs

Table 4 shows the results of multiple regression analysis regarding the two research hypotheses. Test of hypotheses was done using B-values, t-values and p-values at 95% confidence interval. The result of test of research hypothesis as in table 4 shows that respondents rejected hypothesis 1 as indicated by the following statistical values: B = -.175; t = -3.000; P < .001. This implies that the application of employee education in the management of SMEs would not significantly predict effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria.

Also, data in Table 4 shows that hypothesis 2 was accepted by the respondents as indicated by the following statistical values: B = .137; t = 2.355; P < .001. This implies that the application of customer focus principle in the management of SMEs would significantly predict effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises in Abia State, Nigeria.

1.8 Discussion of Results

The result of regression analysis showed that the application of customer focus principle would significantly predict effective performance in small and medium scale enterprises. This is shown by the significant positive influence of customer focus on SME performance (B = .137; t = 2.355; P < .001). Also, the result of Pearson correlation analysis showed that there was a significant positive correlation between customer focus and effective SME performance (r = 0.11, P = .07). This suggests that directing attention towards understanding and meeting customer needs and preferences leads to improved business outcomes. This finding underscores the importance of customer-centric strategies in driving success for small and medium-sized enterprises (SMEs).

This therefore highlights the significance of building strong customer relationships and delivering value-added products and services to customers. An enterprise that pays lip service to customer services is doomed to lose customers' loyalty and retention. This thus, leads to multiplier effects of decline in sales, market share and profitability of the enterprise. The result of this study corroborates extant findings by many scholars (Abrokwah-Larbi, 2023; Tryson (2022); Sarli, Budiyanto & Suwitho, 2021; Neneh (2017) who found that customer focus has a significant positive impact on SME performance. The results of the current study further agree with Asaari, Karia, Kassim and Yahya (2020) who in their study on business performance of small medium enterprise: strategic planning and customer focus, found that the implementation of total quality management principle (customer focus) has high correlation with business results. However, result of this study disagrees with AlQershi, Mokhtar and Abas (2020) who in their study found that customer focus had no effect on the performance of SMEs.

Furthermore, the result of regression analysis (hypothesis testing) showed that the application of employee education principle would not significantly predict the performance of small and medium scale enterprises. This is shown by the negative effect of employee education on effective SME performance (B = -.175; t = -3.000; P < .001). Also, the result of pearson correlation analysis showed that there was negative correlation between employee education and effective SME performance (r = -.15, P = .01). This implies that investments in employee education and training programmes do not substantially influence or lead to effective performance in SME as hypothesized. This result suggests that beyond formal education of employees, other factors such as years of experience, conducive work environment, motivation and job satisfaction, play more prominent role in shaping employee performance and organizational outcomes within SMEs. Besides, highly educated employees may become complacent, unready to re-learn emerging innovative methods of operation and may have aversion to collaboration and teamwork. However, the relationship between employee education and productivity or performance in SME may depend on the sector in which the enterprise operates or the type of business involved. The level of employee education may have significant positive relationship with performance in SMEs that require more of cognitive ability than practical skills and vice versa. These findings underscore the complexity of factors influencing SME's performance and highlight the need for a holistic understanding of the organizational context and dynamics. While employee education is undoubtedly an important component of organizational strategy and development, its direct impact on SME's performance may be less pronounced than previously assumed if not accompanied with employee job satisfaction and motivation. Further research is warranted to explore the interplay between these variables and other contextual factors to inform evidence-based strategies for enhancing SME's competitiveness and sustainability. The result of this study disagrees with Sirinaga, Khatibi and Azam (2020) whose study revealed a strong relationship between employee training and performance of SMEs in the apparel sector. Also, the result of this study is at variance with other findings by scholars such as Timothy (2022), Klepić (2021), Oluwadare (2021), Saah (2020); and Nisser and Ibrahim (2018) who found that training and development of employees have positive effects on the performance of SMEs in construction industry in Nigeria.

1.9 Conclusion

Based on the results of the study, it is concluded that customer focus as a principle of total quality management has a significant positive correlation with performance of SME. The practice of customer focus by managers of SMEs would significantly lead to effective business performance. On the other hand, the study further concludes that giving employees opportunity for further education and training or employing workers with higher level of education would not lead to improved business performance unless such employees are duly motivated to work and are satisfied with their job conditions.

2.0 Recommendations

Based on the results of the study, it is recommended that business educators, curriculum planners and heads of administration in the Departments of Business education should endeavor to ensure that topics relating to customer focus and customer services are included in the Business education curriculum and are taught using learner-centered pedagogies. This will help to make the students to acquire higher order skills and competencies needed to entrench customer focus in the management of their business enterprises upon their graduation. More so, managers of SMEs should not only give employees opportunity for further education but should also motivate their employees to put in their best at work by providing them with incentives, bonuses, conducive work environment and enhanced remuneration. Doing so will help to attract and retain educated personnel who would be committed to improving the performance of the enterprise.

References

- Abrokwah-Larbi, K. (2023). The impact of customer-focus on the performance of business organizations: evidence from SMEs in an emerging West African economy. *African Journal of Economic and Management Studies*, DOI 10.1108/AJEMS-04-2022-0167
- Ademola, I. S; Olaleye, S. O.; Olusuyi, A. E.; Edun, F. (2018). Why small scale businesses failed as a remedy to unemployment problem in Nigeria. *IOSR Journal of Humanities and Social Science*, 8 (4). 56-61.
- Aigboje, P. O., Akpa, V. O. & Egwakhe, J. A. (2021). Quality management and profitability selected manufacturing SMEs in Port Harcourt and Aba, Nigeria. *The Strategic Journal of Business and Change Management*, 8 (2), 45 57.
- Ali, K. & Johl, S. K. (2021): Soft and hard TQM practices: future research agenda for industry 4.0. Total Quality Management & Business Excellence, DOI:10.1080/14783363.2021.1985448
- Al-Dhaafri, H. S.; Al-Swidi, A. K.; Yusoff, R. Z. B. (2016). The mediating role of TQM and organizational excellence, and the moderating effect of entrepreneurial organizational culture on the relationship between ERP and organizational performance. *Total Quality Management Journal*, 28, 991–1011
- AlQershi, N; Mokhtar, S. S. M; and Abas, Z. B. (2020). Innovative CRM and performance of SMEs: The moderating role of relational capital. *Journal of Open Innovation, Technology, Market and Complexity*, 6,155.
- Aper, I. & Ushahemba, A. (2021). Total quality management and performance of small medium

- scale enterprises (SMEs) in Nigeria. South Asian Research Journal of Business and Management, 3(6). 204 214
- Aribaba, F. O.; Ahmodu, O.A.; Olaleye, B. R.; Yusuff, S. A. (2019). Ownership structure and organizational performance in selected listed manufacturing companies in Nigeria. *Journal of Business Studies Management Review*, *3*, 9–14.
- Anifowose, O. N; Ghasemi, M. & Olaleye, B. R. (2022). Total quality management and small and medium-sized enterprises' (SMEs) performance: mediating role of innovation speed. *Sustainability*, *14*, 8719. https://doi.org/10.3390/su14148719
- Asaari, M. H. A. N; Karia, N.; Kassim, S. and Yahya, S. (2020). Business performance of small medium enterprise: strategic planning and customer focus. *Information Technology and Organizations in the 21st Century.* 113-116
- Aziz, R. A.; Mahmood, R.; Tajudin, A.; Abdullah, M. H. (2014). The relationship between entrepreneurial orientation and business performance of SMEs in Malaysia. *International Journal of Management Excellence*, 2, 221–226
- Bamfo, A. and Kraa, J. J. (2019). Market orientation and performance of small and medium enterprises in Ghana: The mediating role of innovation, *Cogent Business and Management*, 6:1, 1605703, DOI: 10.1080/23311975.2019.1605703
- Dikeocha, L. U; Nwaiwu, B.N; Nwagu, C. C and Amaechi, L. (2018). Promoting small scale business: road map for a rapid national development. *Nigerian Journal of Business Education (NIGJBED)*, 5(2), 132-140.
- Douglas, T. J., & Judge, W. Q. (2017). Total quality management implementation and competitive advantage: the role of structural control and exploration. *Academy of Management Journal*, 44, 158-169.
- Dzisi, S., & Ofosu, D. (2014). Marketing strategies and the performance of SMEs in Ghana. *European Journal of Business and Management*, 6(5), 102-111
- Gisaor, V. I., Iyortsuun, A. S. & Musa, J. (2019). Small and medium scale enterprises (SMEs) and economic recovery in Nigeria: a case study of selected SMEs in Makurdi, Benue State, Nigeria. *Paper presented at the 2019 International Conference of Management and Finance*, 18 19 June, Gombe.152-168
- Herzallah, A. M.; Gutiérrez-Gutiérrez, L. & Munoz, R. J. F. (2014). Total quality management principles, competitive strategies and financial performance: The case of the Palestinian industrial SMEs. *Total Quality Management Business Excellence*. 25, 635–649.
- Hietschold, N.; Reinhardt, R. & Gurtner, S. (2014). Measuring critical success factors of TQM implementation successfully a systematic literature review. *International Journal of Production Res.* 52(21), 6254–6272
- Igbadio, A. & Asamber, U. (2021). Total quality management and performance of small medium scale enterprises in Nigeria. *South Asian Research Journal of Business and Management*, 3(6). 204-214
- Igwe, P. A., Ogundana, A. N., Egere, O. M., & Anigbo, J. A. (2018). Factors affecting the investment climate, SMEs productivity, and Entrepreneurship in Nigeria. *European Journal of Sustainable Development*, 7, 1, 182-200. Doi:10.14207/ejsd.2018.v7n1p182
- Klepić, I. (2021). Correlation between training and education of human resources and business

- performance of small and medium enterprises. *Naše gospodarstvo/Our Economy*, 67(3), 1-16. DOI: 10.2478/ngoe-2021-0013
- Kober, R.; Subraamanniam, T. and Watson, J. (2016). The impact of total quality adoption on small and medium enterprise's financial performance. *Accounting and Finance*. 52, 161–182.
- Lin, F. & Lin, Y. (2016). The effect of network relationship on the performance of SMEs. *Journal of Business Research*, 69(5).1780-1784
- Neneh, B. N. (2017). Customer orientation and SME performance: the role of networking ties. African Journal of Economic and Management Studies, 9(2). 178-196. https://doi.org/10.1108/AJEMS-03-2017-0043
- Nisser, A. I.; and Ibrahim, N. (2018). The effect of education level and experience on SME performance in Libya. *International Journal for Studies on Children, Women, Elderly and Disabled*, 4(6). 260 264
- Nworgu, B. G. (2015). *Educational research: basic issues & methodology (third edition)*. Nsukka: University Trust Publishers
- Musavi, V. L. & Maingi, J. (2017). Effect of credit and education on performance of micro and small enterprises in Kenya. *Amity Journal of Economics*, 2(2). 21-35
- Odinaka, A. (222). Aba leather industry: Made-in-Nigeria brand waiting for government's lifeline. *Punch Newspaper 21st June, 2022*.
- Okeowo, G. & Fatoba, I. (2022). State of States report 2022 edition. www.yourbudgit.com Olusanya, S. O. & Adegbola, E. A. (2014). Impact of total quality management principle on small and medium scale enterprises in Nigeria. (A case study of small business owners in Lagos). *IOSR Journal of Business and Management (IOSR-JBM)*, 16(4).39-45
- Oluwadare, I. A. (2021). Effects of training and development on the performance of construction small and medium enterprises in Nigeria. *Uniosun International Journal of Business Administration*, 2(1), 98-113
- Saah, P. (2020). The impact of education and training on the success of small and medium-sized enterprises. *Journal of Economics Education and Entrepreneurship*, 3(2).112-122
- Sader, S. S. A.; Husti, I. & Daroczi, M. (2017). Suggested indicators to measure the impact of Industry 4.0 on total quality management. *International Science Journal* 6, 298–301
- Sahoo, S.; Yadav, S. (2018). Total quality management in Indian manufacturing SMEs. *Procedia Manufacturing*, 21, 541–548.
- Sarli, R.; Budiyanto, I.; and Suwitho, A. (2021). Effect of market orientation on SMEs' marketing performance in the creative economy sector and how innovation mediate it. *International Journal of Economics Development Research*, 2(2), 78-91
- Sirinaga, I. P. W.; Khatibi, A. and Azam, S. M. F. (2020). the effect of knowledge management and employee training on performance of small and medium-scaled enterprises: employee training as a mediator. *European Journal of Human Resource Management Studies*, 4(1). 1-21
- Snongtaweeporn, T.; Siribensanont, C.; Kongsong, W.; & Channuwong, S. (2020). Total quality management in modern organizations by using participation and teamwork. *Journal of Arts Management*, 4(3). 794 805

- Timothy, V. L. (2022). The effect of top managers' human capital on SME productivity: the mediating role of innovation. *Heliyon* 8, e09330. https://doi.org/10.1016/j.heliyon.2022.e09330
- Tryson, Y. (2022). The mediating effect of customer focus on the relationship between strategic planning and competitive advantage in railway sector. *Journal of Operations and Strategic Planning 5(1) 59–81*
- Ugwu, C. (2023). Scorecard: Infant mortality, Poverty worsen, IGR improves under Ikpeazu in Abia. *Premium Times Newspaper*, 26th, March, 2023.
- Uzoho, P. (2023). Report: Nigeria still poverty capital of the world. *ThisDay newspaper*. Saturday, 28th January, 2023
- Wubante, M. (2020). Review on correlation research. *International Journal of English Literature* and Culture. 8(4). 99-106